Mr. Antonio Almonte Reynoso, Minister of Energy and Mining, Dominican Republic

Mr. Orlando Jorge Mera, Minister of the Environment and Natural Resources, Dominican Republic

Mr. Mark Bristow, President and CEO, Barrick Gold Corporation

Ms. Juana Barceló, President, Barrick Pueblo Viejo

May 4, 2021

Dear Mr. Reynoso, Mr. Mera, Mr. Bristow and Ms. Barceló,

The undersigned organizations write in solidarity with the <u>communities</u> in Monte Plata that are <u>resisting</u> Barrick Gold's planned expansion in the Dominican Republic. Based on available public information, we are deeply concerned about the environmental and human rights impacts of the expansion. These concerns are even more acute in the context of the ongoing global climate emergency and the Dominican Republic's climate vulnerability, serious and credible allegations of water contamination and displacement in other Barrick Gold operations, and the opaque nature of the expansion process. In light of the concerns set out below and the significant community opposition to the plans, we urge the Dominican Republic and Barrick Gold to reconsider the expansion.

We are concerned that Barrick Gold is planning to expand its gold mining activities in the Dominican Republic. Barrick currently operates Pueblo Viejo, an open-pit mine located on 4,800 hectares of land in Sánchez Ramírez, approx. 100km outside of the Dominican Republic's capital city of Santo Domingo, through a joint venture with Newmont. Last year, Barrick proposed an expansion of Pueblo Viejo that included a new tailings dam - reportedly in the province of Monte Plata - that would store toxic mining byproducts. Local social movements have expressed concern about the proposed tailings dam and organized demonstrations in opposition to it. Government officials (including the president of the Alianza País political party and an official representing Monte Plata), civil society (including Centro Montalvo and the Archbishop of Santo Domingo), and others have expressed solidarity with community members and are raising the alarm about this project. We have been unable to determine the status of the environmental impact assessment for the tailings dam project from publicly available information.

¹ PATRICIA CAFFEY ET AL., *Dominican Republic Climate Change V ulnerability Assessment Report* (2013), https://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1862/Dominican%20Republic%20Climate%20Change%20Vuln erability%20Assessment%20Report.pdf (last visited Oct 16, 2020).

² Barrick Gold Using Coercive Settlement Provisions to Perpetuate Legacy of Environmental Harm, EARTHRIGHTS INTERNATIONAL, https://earthrights.org/blog/barrick-gold-using-coercive-settlement-provisions-to-perpetuate-legacy-of-environmental-harm/ (last visited Feb 15, 2021); COLUMBIA LAW SCHOOL, Red Water: Mining and the Right to Water in Porgera, Papua New Guinea (2019), https://web.law.columbia.edu/system/files/private_file/red-water-report-2019_1.pdf; Murder, rape and claims of contamination at a Tanzanian goldmine, THE GUARDIAN (2019),

http://www.theguardian.com/environment/2019/jun/18/murder-rape-claims-of-contamination-tanzanian-goldmine (last visited Feb 15, 2021). Security Guards for World's Largest Gold Mining Company Rape and Kill Locals in Papua New Guinea, EARTHRIGHTS INTERNATIONAL, https://earthrights.org/case/barrick/ (last visited Apr. 20, 2021)

³ GLOBAL JUSTICE CLINIC (GJC) AT NEW YORK UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW & HAITI JUSTICE INITIATIVE, Byen Konte, Mal Kalkile? Human Rights and Environmental Risks of Gold Mining in Haiti (2015), 91, https://chrgj.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/byen_konte_mal_kalkile_human_rights_and_environmental_risks_of_gold_mining_in_haiti.pdf.

Expanding gold mining in the Dominican Republic will increase the country's vulnerability to climate change. Monte Plata – the anticipated location of Barrick's new tailings dam – is home to many of the country's most vital watersheds. 4 Twelve rivers originate in the province, including the Ozama River, which provides water to the capital Santo Domingo. Climate change threatens access to sufficient and clean water in the Dominican Republic; a tailings dam in this area risks jeopardizing water resources that are vital for climate resilience, including to withstand drought. The Dominican Republic suffered 165 drought events in the last 35 years and evidence shows that these disasters are increasing in intensity and length. National rainfall levels are projected to fall by as much as 8.5 percent over the next three decades. According to environmental experts, two-thirds of the population will face acute water shortages within four years. Already, about three out of four Dominicans depend on bottled water to survive. 5 Risks to water have ripple effects on human health, agriculture, food security, livelihoods, biodiversity and more, all of which are already threatened by increasingly erratic seasons and extreme events like storms and floods.⁷ This is of particular concern given that the Dominican Republic "is among the countries that are most exposed to natural disasters in the world, ranking 8th out of 183 countries." It is not clear how the expansion is compatible with the government's first strategic priority, per its National Climate Adaption Plan, of improving water and food security.

The expansion – including the proposed tailings dam – is inherently risky. Modern industrial gold mines frequently have widespread, negative environmental and human impacts, including on the local ecology and the existing uses of land, water, and other natural resources. Tailings dams – the most common and cheapest way to store mining waste – hold specific risks. Tailings dams have failed over 100 times more frequently than reservoir and power dams over the past century, even in highly regulated places like Australia, Canada and Brazil. Tailings dam collapses can cause devastating loss of life, environmental contamination, and serious consequences for human health. Heavy rainfall is a leading cause of such failures, suggesting that climate change will exacerbate the problem. Best practice states that tailings dams should not be built upstream from inhabited areas, as appears to be

¹¹ *Id*.

⁴ Ley que Declara la Provincia Monte Plata,

http://www.senado.gov.do/masterlex/MLX/docs/1C/2/12/20/207/20D7.htm (last visited Feb 15, 2021).

⁵ IANAS LA RED INTERAMERICANA DE ACADEMIAS DE CIENCIAS, Calidad del Agua en las Américas: Riesgos y Oportunidades (2019)., 561.

⁶ GENERAL COMMENT NO. 15: THE RIGHT TO WATER (ARTS. 11 AND 12 OF THE COVENANT), E/C.12/2002/11), 18 15 (2003), https://www.refworld.org/pdfid/4538838d11.pdf.

⁷ IANAS LA RED INTERAMERICANA DE ACADEMIAS DE CIENCIAS, *supra* note 5.

⁸ GLOBAL JUSTICE CLINIC (GJC), *supra* note 3, at 94-97.

⁹ GLOBAL JUSTICE CLINIC (GJC), *supra* note 3, at 5, 87-88.

Michelle Kalamandeen et al., Limited biomass recovery from gold mining in Amazonian forests, 57 J. APPL. ECOL. 1730–1740 (2020).

Theodore E. Downing, Avoiding new poverty: mining-Induced displacement and resettlement, mining, minerals and sustainable development, INT. INST. ENVIRON. DEV. WORLD BUS. COUNC. SUSTAIN. DEV. LOND. (2002).

¹⁰ Warren Cornwall, *Catastrophic failures raise alarm about dams containing muddy mine wastes*, SCIENCE, 2020, https://www.sciencemag.org/news/2020/08/catastrophic-failures-raise-alarm-about-dams-containing-muddy-mine-wastes (last visited Feb 15, 2021).

¹² Dom Phillips, Samarco dam collapse: one year on from Brazil's worst environmental disaster, THE GUARDIAN, October 15, 2016, https://www.theguardian.com/sustainable-business/2016/oct/15/samarco-dam-collapse-brazil-worst-environmental-disaster-bhp-billiton-vale-mining (last visited Feb 15, 2021); Daniel A. Barcelos et al., Gold mining tailing: Environmental availability of metals and human health risk assessment, 397 J. HAZARD. MATER. 122721 (2020).

¹³ John Handmer et al., *Changes in impacts of climate extremes: human systems and ecosystems, in* Managing the risks of extreme events and disasters to advance climate change adaptation: special report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change 231–290, 249 (2012).

the case for the proposed tailings dam in Monte Plata. Further, the existing Pueblo Viejo mine sits in a high seismic and high rainfall area, and the proposed expansion may have the same environmental qualities.¹⁴

Existing Barrick operations in the Dominican Republic and globally have faced repeated credible allegations of environmental harm. A 2012 report by the Dominican Academy of Sciences concluded that Barrick operations were "contaminating the dam of Hatillo, the country's biggest dam" that irrigates the rice crop of the Lower Yuna Basin. Locals allege that Barrick's work at the mine also exacerbated pollution of the local Maguaca and Margajita rivers. Though Barrick disputes responsibility for the pollution, media reports indicate that communities impacted by the pollution have for years depended on bottled water provided by the government and by Barrick. In 2014, it was reported that tests of nearby residents revealed high levels of cyanide and other metals in their urine and blood, substances that lead to health problems including skin and eye damage. By 2015, an estimated 27 deaths linked to pollution had been reported. Locals have reported death of their livestock and inedible crops, and claim that gains to the local economy are negligible.

Environmental degradation <u>associated with Barrick</u>'s mines – including in <u>Tanzania</u>, the <u>United States</u> and the <u>Philippines</u> – throws serious doubt on Barrick's readiness to mitigate the worst impacts of gold mining, or tailings dams in particular. At its Porgera mine in <u>Papua New Guinea</u>, for example, Barrick "<u>dumped more than 6 million tonnes of tailings and more than 12 million tonnes of sediment eroded from the waste rock dumps into the river in 2008" under government permits. Its operations in <u>Chile and Argentina</u> were halted by the judiciary based on claims of significant damage to glaciers and waterways in a UNESCO protected biosphere.</u>

The expansion process has been opaque and non-participatory. Local communities have the right under <u>national</u> and <u>international law</u> to meaningfully participate in environmental decisions that affect them and to access information about those decisions.¹⁷ Barrick's own <u>policies</u> also commit it to transparent communication and engagement in its operations, including with local communities. So far, these commitments do not appear to have been upheld. Although the Minister of Energy and Mines has affirmed that an environmental impact assessment of the proposed tailings dam expansion must be carried out and approved by the government for the project to proceed, we have found no information online about the current <u>status or substance of this process</u>. At the same time, the Minister of Energy and Mines has already <u>expressed</u> its support for the expansion and, in 2020, the government <u>accepted</u> an advance of US\$108 million in taxes and royalties from Barrick in order to address the COVID-19 pandemic. While <u>the Minister has said that this payment is not linked to approval of the</u>

visited Apr. 20, 2021)

¹⁴ BCG Engineering, *Pueblo Viejo Mine*, https://bgcengineering.ca/mining_pueblo_viejo.html (last visited Mar 11, 2021).

¹⁵ RED INTERAMERICANA DE ACADEMIAS DE CIENCIAS FORO CONSULTIVO CIENTÍFICO Y TECNOLÓGICO, AC, <u>Diagnóstico del Agua en Las Américas</u>, 435 (2013)

¹⁶ EARTH LAW CENTER, Implementation of human rights obligations relating to the environment, submission to the UN Special Rapporteur on Human Rights and the Environment (2015) 95, https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Environment/ImplementationReport/Earth%20Law%20Center.pdf (last

¹⁷ See Dominican Environmental Law articles 6 and 38(8) (guaranteeing the rights to a healthy environment, information on sustainable use of natural resources and the environment, and public consultation as part of environmental assessments).

See also Regional Agreement on Access to Information, Public Participation and Justice in Environmental Matters in Latin America and the Caribbean (the Escazú Agreement), Escazú, 4 March 2018, articles 3-7; the Escazú Agreement will enter into force on 22 April 2021; the DR has signed but not yet ratified the Agreement.

<u>expansion</u>, these developments raise serious concerns about the independence and integrity of the environmental impact assessment and approval process.

We call on the Dominican government and Barrick to make public verifiable evidence of how:

- The company and the government would uphold the rights of local communities affected by the expansion, including in light of the track record of environmental contamination from the Pueblo Viejo mine,
- The expansion would avoid the environmental damages incurred in other Barrick mining operations,
- The expansion is consistent with President Abinader's commitment to make the Dominican Republic a world leader in climate justice,
- The expansion is consistent with the Dominican government's <u>twin priorities</u> of post-pandemic economic recovery and sustainability,
- Barrick's ongoing and expanded operations in the Dominican Republic are consistent with the recently enumerated *Principles for a Just Recovery*, produced by over 150 Canadian civil society groups, and with Barrick's own commitment to be "serious about sustainability", including working towards poverty reduction and managing its environmental impacts.

Based on the available evidence, satisfactory answers to these questions are not possible. As such, the undersigned organizations maintain that Barrick's expansion in the Dominican Republic must not proceed as planned.

Signed:

Coordinating Organizations:

Earthworks 1612 K ST., NW, Suite 904, Washington, D.C., 20006 Contact: jmorrill@earthworksaction.org

Global Justice Clinic

Washington Square Legal Services, Inc.

245 Sullivan Street, 5th Floor New York, NY 10012

Contact: sms1118@nyu.edu

Communications from the Global Justice Clinic do not purport to represent the institutional views of NYU School of Law, if any

MiningWatch Canada 508-250 City Centre Ave, Ottawa, ON K1R 6K7, Canada Contact: diana@miningwatch.ca

Asia

Marinduque Council for Environmental Concerns (MACEC)

High Town, Boac, Marinduque, Philippines

Ang Aroroy Ay Alagaan, Inc. Barangay San Isidro, Aroroy, Masbate, Philippines

Europe

Environmental Justice Atlas (EJAtlas) Montchaboud, France Fundación Montescola Lousame, Galiza, Spain Programme de Volontariat en Intag France

The Gaia Foundation East Sussex, United Kingdom

Global Forest Coalition Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Igapo Project Rochefort Sur Loire, France

London Mining Network London, United Kingdom

Polish Zero Waste Association Warszawa, Poland

Salva la Selva Hamburg, Germany

War on Want United Kingdom

Water Justice and Gender Wageningen, Netherlands

Caribbean

Action pour la Reforestation et la Defense de l'Environnement(AREDE) Nord'Est, Haiti

Centre de Formation pour l'Entraide et le Développement Communautaire (CFEDEC) Haiti

Centro de Reflexión y Acción Padre Juan Montalvo (Centro Montalvo) Distrito Nacional, República Dominicana

Centro de Formación para Mujeres Organizadas María Liberadora (CEFORMOMALI) Dominican Republic

Confederación Nacional de Mujeres Campesinas (CONAMUCA) Dominican Republic

Mouvement paysan Acul-du-Nord (MPA) Haiti Sosyete Kiltirèl Jèn Ayisyen (SOKIJA) Port-de-Paix, Haïti

Central & South America

350.org América Latina Brazil

ACCION ECOLOGICA Quito, Ecuador

Asamblea por el Agua del Guasco Alto Comuna de Alto del Carmen, Valle del Huasco, Región de Atacama, Chile

Asociación Amigos de San Isidro Cabañas ASIC San Isidro, Cabañas, El Salvador

Asociación de Desarrollo Económico Social Santa Marta (ADES) Sensuntepeque, Cabañas, El Salvador

Associação de Defesa do Rio Coxipó Cuiabá, Mato Grosso, Brazil

Campanha Antipetroleira Nem um poço a mais! Brazil

Centro de Estudios Heñói Asunción, Paraguay

Colectivo VientoSur Santiago, Chile

Defensa y Conservación Ecológica de Intag Cotacachi, Imbabura, Ecuador

Diálogo 2000-Jubileo Sur Argentina Buenos Aires, Argentina

Grupo de Ecología Integral de la Red de Centros Sociales de la Conferencia de Provinciales de América Latina y el Caribe (RCS / CPAL). Brazil

Grupo de Pesquisa e Extensão Política, Economia, Mineração, Ambiente e Sociedade (PoEMAS) Brazil Marcha Mundial de las Mujeres - Chile Chile

Mesa Nacional frente a la Minería Metálica en El Salvador

San Salvador, El Salvador

Movimento dos Atingidos por Barragens (MAB) Brazil

Observatório Nacional de Justiça Socioamvimetal Luciano Mendes de Almeida (OLMA-Brasil) Brazil

Observatorio Plurinacional de Salares Andinos Puna de Atacama

Observatorio Social de Mato Grosso Cuiabá, Brasil

Plataforma Latinoamericana y del Caribe por la Justicia Climática

Taller Ecologista Rosario, Argentina

TerraJusta Bolivia

North America

Allard K. Lowenstein International Human Rights Clinic, Yale Law School New Haven, Connecticut, USA

Bâtirente

Montreal, Quebec, Canada

Bios Iguana A. C. Colima, Mexico

Black Hills Clean Water Alliance Rapid City, South Dakota, USA

Canadian Jesuits International (CJI) Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Center for Biological Diversity Tucson, Arizona, USA Center for Gender & Refugee Studies San Francisco, California, USA

Comité por los derechos humanos en América

Latina (CDHAL)

Montréal, Québec, Canada

Cooperation Canada

Canada

Denver Justice and Peace Committee (DJPC)

Denver, Colorado, USA

Development and Peace - Caritas Canada

Montreal, Quebec, Canada

EarthRights International Washington D.C., USA

Friends of Buckingham Buckingham, Virginia, USA

Great Basin Resource Watch

Reno, Nevada, USA

Hastings-to-Haiti Partnership San Francisco, California, USA

Hawai'i Institute for Human Rights Hawai'i, USA

Hexavest

Montreal, Quebec, Canada

Human Rights and Privatization Project, NYU

School of Law New York, USA

Inter Pares

Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

Institute for Policy Studies - Global Economy

Program

Washington D.C., USA

The Leap

Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

Lynn Canal Conservation Haines, Alaska, USA Malach Consulting Spanish Fork, Utah, USA

Maritimes-Guatemala Breaking the Silence Network Nova Scotia, Canada

Mining Injustice Solidarity Network Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Multicultural Alliance for a Safe Environment Albuquerque, New Mexico, USA

New Mexico Environmental Law Center Santa Fe, New Mexico, USA

Procesos Integrales para la Autogestión de los Pueblos Ciudad de México, Mexico

Project Ploughshares Saskatoon Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, Canada

Projet Accompagnement Québec-Guatemala (PAQG) Montreal, Quebec, Canada

RAVEN (Respecting Aboriginal Values and Environmental Needs) Victoria, British Columbia, Canada

Red Mexicana de Afectadas/os por la Minería (REMA) Ciudad de México, Mexico

Rights Action Toronto, Ontario, Canada

RRSE (Regroupement pour la Responsabilité Sociale des Entreprises) Montreal, Quebec, Canada

Santa Clara Law - International Human Rights Clinic Santa Clara, California, USA

Saskatoon Peace Coalition Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, Canada VANA (Veterans Against \nuclear Arms) Saskatoon Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, Canada

Oceana

Aid/Watch Australia

Akali Tange Association Inc' Human Rights Advocacy group Porgera Enga Province, Papua New Guinea

Human Rights Inter-Pacific Association Wabag, Enga Province, Papua New Guinea

Porgera 119 Indigenous woman Association Porgera, Papua New Guinea

Porgera Red Wara (River) Women's Association Incorporated (PRWWA INC.) Yanjakale Village, Porgera District, Enga Province, Papua New Guinea

Porgera Women's Rights Watch Inc. Wabag, Enga Province, Papua New Guinea